SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard May 27, 2010

Present: Robert Ferguson, Jennifer Haskamp, Pat Igo, Rich Laffin, John Manning, Matt Mazanec,

David Riehle, Mark Thomas, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel

Absent: Lee Meyer (excused)

Staff Present: Christine Boulware, Amy Spong

PUBLIC HEARING

CALL TO ORDER: 5:05 PM by John Manning (Chair)

I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA – move Items V.D. & V.E. up on the agenda, Ferguson, Mazanec – 8-0.

II. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST - None

III. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Commissioner Manning thanked the commissioners who worked on the Preservation Awards event for their work.

IV. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS - None

V. PERMIT REVIEW/PUBLIC HEARING

A. 359-361 Maria Avenue, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, by Stephanie Oh, owner, for a building permit to alter the front porch. File #10-023 (Boulware, 266-6715). Withdrawn by Applicant

B. 538-540 Laurel Avenue, Hill Historic District, by Shane Rose Construction, for a building permit to remove the terra cotta roof tiles and replace them with a coated steel roofing system. **File #10-024** (Boulware, 266-6715)

Staff read the report recommending denial of the application. Jayna and Roger Paquin, owners of 540 Laurel, and Scot Germscheid and John Hanson, applicants, were present to discuss the application. They stated the property had been foreclosed and since purchasing it has invested a lot into it. They also stated the proposed material is practical and affordable. The owners and contractors pointed out that the upper porch roof is "dipping" in the middle and that tile is not suited to this climate. The contractors stated that you can't see the entire roof and that the tiles put too much weight on the roof and were not appropriate for this climate. They added that there are falling tiles and showed a sample of the material that they propose to install. The contractors stated that 30 feet from the ground you wouldn't be able to tell the difference between the tile and the metal panel. The applicants noted the expense and availability of historic material. They added that the roof is expensive and highly impractical. The applicant stated that one-third of the tiles are cracked. The owners noted that due to the sagging they've already invested in patching the stucco.

Trout-Oertel stated that the texture of the product sample doesn't replicate clay tile and that the tiles are an attribute of the property. Manning asked if there were any other bids for repair or replacement of the missing tiles. The contractors stated that tiles are no longer shipped here from the Southwest. Manning suggested a win-win situation would be to repair and replace with like materials. The contractor asked if the HPC would want them to install concrete tiles. Ferguson stated the profiles are very different. The contractor replied that they are the same. Laffin recalled a job he worked on in a Minneapolis historic district where clay tiles were installed and stated he has not heard a warning about clay tiles and issued with this climate. He suggested they look into Ludowici tiles. The contract replied that clay tiles are an expensive headache. Igo asked about the size of the roof and the amount of clay tile. The owner informed that there are three to four tubs of the clay tile in the

basement of the property. Manning suggested laying over the item to explore other bids and Laffin suggested they look at tile options. **Trimble motioned to lay over the item. Igo seconded the motion.** The motion to lay over passed 9-0.

C. 298 Exchange Street South, Irvine Park Historic District. By Ramsey County Public Health, for a building permit to replace window sash in one unit of the duplex. **File#10-025** (Boulware, 266-6715)

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Staff read a letter of support for the project from the property owner. **Trout-Oertel motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations.** Ferguson seconded the motion. The motion passed 9-0.

D. Union Depot Central Corridor Station and Artwork, Final Design Review, Lowertown Historic District, by Metropolitan Council/Central Corridor Project Office, for a building permit to construct the platform and station with art, lighting and way-finding signs. File #09-027 (Spong, 266-6714)

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Alicia Vap, Metropolitan Council, was present to speak on behalf of the applicant. Ms. Vap clarified that the lighting for the platform would be located on the platform. Ms. Vap showed images of graphic wayfinding signs and stated that all of the proposed materials have similar colors, including the poured concrete, steel and stainless steel railings. Commissioner Igo asked if they were on the same page regarding granite pavers and Ms. Vap stated that they are but there are none being proposed in the Lowertown Historic District. Commissioner Laffin applauded the use of silver colors as they have a tendency to be background or "chameleon" in nature. Commissioner Thomas concurred. There was no one else to speak and the public hearing was closed. Igo motioned to approve the staff recommendation but exclude the artwork. Laffin seconded the motion. A friendly amendment was made and accepted to delete sentence three of staff recommendation number 1 because the materials were acceptable. The motion passed 9 to 0.

E. Raymond Central Corridor Station and Artwork, Final Design Review, University-Raymond Commercial Historic District, by Metropolitan Council/Central Corridor Project Office, for a building permit to construct the platform and station with art, lighting and way-finding signs. **File #09-028** (Spong, 266-6714)

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Alicia Vap, Metropolitan Council, was present to speak on behalf of the applicant. Ms. Vap stated that there would be wayfinding signs on the exterior of the information kiosks and advertising on the interior. Ms. Vap stated there are four total wayfinding signs and that the materials are all still in the grayish/brown family of colors. Commissioner Mazanec asked if they would be open to only wayfinding signs and not logos and Ms. Vap stated that would be fine. No one else was present to speak and the public hearing was closed. Igo motioned to approve the staff recommendation and Laffin seconded the motion. Igo stated that the granite pavers a real important. Igo asked for an amendment to remove sentence three of staff recommendation number 1 given that the materials seemed fine and to add the language "that go beyond wayfinding" at staff recommendation number 4. The two friendly amendments were accepted and the motion passed 9 to 0.

F. 689 Fourth Street East, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, by Historic Saint Paul, for a demolition permit to remove the building for green space and off-street parking for the adjacent structures at 685 & 693 Fourth Street East. **File#10-026** (Boulware, 266-6715)

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Ellen Biales, Legislative Aide to Council President Kathy Lantry, was present to give a history of the Fourth Street Project. She added that Fourth Street is the core of the Dayton's Bluff Historic District. Sheri Pemberton, Project Manager in Planning and Economic Development, added that the City has been acquiring these properties for several years and now own five on the north side and two on the south side of the street. The City also owns three houses at Bates and Conway and several on Maria. Carol Carey, Executive Director at Historic Saint Paul and Dayton's Bluff Resident, stated this was her first demolition application and she thought it "deserves a few words." She explained that the Fourth Street block is challenged

with vacant buildings and absentee landlords. She noted that the proximity of 689 Fourth Street to the adjacent property is a hindrance and its removal would open up more opportunities for the block. Mazanec asked if the demolition were approved, if there was a plan to salvage materials to be reused. Pemberton replied they will save what is useful and that currently there is a deconstruction pilot project. Trimble stated he has a big concern about "what happens later." He stated this would set bad precedent and other people will want to demolish homes to build garages. He added that the reason no one bought the homes was because of a lot of rules and regulations and that rehabilitation costs are a lot higher and sweat equity couldn't be used. He said he would hope the City would partner with more non-profits. Igo stated that the demolition is a big concern, but that he could see a bigger picture here. Thomas stated that the loss of history is a loss of community asset. Haskamp stated the demolition would help create a conforming lot. Igo motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations. Mazanec seconded the motion. The motion passed 8-1-1 (Trimble against and Riehle abstaining).

VI. PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

A. 326 Maria Avenue and 685, 693 & 695 Fourth Street East, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, for preliminary review of general exterior work at the properties such as: re-roofing, gutters, downspouts, siding, trim, soffits and porch repair/restoration. (Spong, 266-6715) Carol Carey, applicant, discussed the demolition plan for 689 Fourth Street East, removal of additions at 326 Maria Avenue and the opening-up of porches on Fourth Street. She added that the rehabilitation of the properties would follow the Dayton's Bluff Design Guidelines. Manning, staff and Jim Glendening discussed demolition of rear additions at 326 Maria. Staff identified the additions as not being contributing features to the property. Glendening identified them as an added coved exit. Glendenning stated the parking schemes addressed green space, and that there are grade changes to deal with. The schemes show both separate and shared driveways and usable rear yard. Scheme "C" has a common turn around area and common space that would be a cost advantage. Laffin stated he understands scheme "C" but believes that paired garages could do the job too. Trimble stated he preferred a shared drive to allow for more green space and asked if a community garden would be considered in the plans. Sheri Pemberton, City staff, stated that either an association or land trust would be created. 685 Fourth Street would either be a side-by-side residence or an owner-occupied duplex. A shared driveway and easement may become a payment of maintenance issue. Manning stated the commission needed to give direction about whether to pursue a separate or shared driveway. He added that Scheme "C" garage was "too cottagey" and needed to look like a secondary structure. Haskamp stated there would concerns from a marketing standpoint for the shared parking and a single-family home. Igo agreed with the marketing issue and added he preferred the single driveway with an easement and maintenance agreement. Trimble stated the "carriage house" would be more appropriate on a bigger lot with a bigger house and that the smaller garages were a better fit. Ferguson stated that he liked Scheme "C" but it would have to be for a condo association. Mazanec agreed with Trimble and preferred A or B with separate garages but had no preference for driveways. Manning asked about maintenance for 685-687 Fourth Street and Pemberton replied it would depend on if it were an owner occupied duplex or separate owner occupied units. Thomas stated green space and community are important and he agreed with Mazanec about separate garages. He added recalling the historic significance of the building to be removed is important and should be incorporated somehow. Trimble asked if the City had the abstracts for the properties. Pemberton replied they did not. Laffin complimented Glendenning's design and asked "where would the snow go?"

The commission summarized the main points of the discussion:

- 1. There was not too much concern for small-scale selective demo, but greater detail would be required for review.
- 2. Garages should compliment the historic rhythm of the block and should be of an appropriate scale
- 3. The HPC was comfortable with a single, shared driveway.

VII. NEW BUSINESS

A. Approve a schematic design for the University-Raymond Commercial Historic District signage.

Commissioners Riehle and Igo stated they liked the streetcar image. Commissioner Trimble thought either the wheel or the streetcar would be appropriate. Commissioner Mazanec thought the streetcar is a historic image and the wheel wouldn't connect well as "historic." Commissioner Manning stated the streetcar may connect more with the Central Corridor and transportation center. Commissioner Laffin stated the image of the wheel was too complicated and preferred the streetcar. Commissioner Ferguson added that he liked the streetcar image in the circle the best.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS

- A. Public Safety Building update (Manning, Igo) None
- **B.** 3M Committee update (Trimble, Mazanec) The design group met and continue to work on guidelines. There will be an Advisory Committee meeting on June 10 at the Carpenters Hall.
- **C.** Preservation Awards Committee (Igo, Laffin, Trout-Oertel) Staff is working to get text to the printers and need help framing the certificates.
- **D.** Public Art St. Paul Stewardship Committee (Laffin) None

IX. ADJOURN: 6:10

Submitted by: C. Boulware